

# Minutes of a meeting of COUNCIL on Monday 28 January 2019

www.oxford.gov.uk



## Council members:

Councillor Cook (Lord Mayor)	Councillor Malik (Deputy Lord Mayor)
Councillor Simmons (Sheriff)	Councillor Altaf-Khan
Councillor Arshad	Councillor Azad
Councillor Aziz	Councillor Bely-Summers
Councillor Brown	Councillor Chapman
Councillor Clarkson	Councillor Corais
Councillor Curran	Councillor Djafari-Marbini
Councillor Donnelly	Councillor Fry
Councillor Gant	Councillor Garden
Councillor Goddard	Councillor Gotch
Councillor Haines	Councillor Harris
Councillor Hayes	Councillor Henwood
Councillor Hollingsworth	Councillor Howlett
Councillor Iley-Williamson	Councillor Kennedy
Councillor Landell Mills	Councillor Lloyd-Shogbesan
Councillor Lygo	Councillor McManners
Councillor Munkonge	Councillor Pressel
Councillor Rush	Councillor Simm
Councillor Linda Smith	Councillor Roz Smith
Councillor Tanner	Councillor Tarver
Councillor Taylor	Councillor Tidball
Councillor Turner	Councillor Upton
Councillor Wade	Councillor Wolff

## Apologies:

Councillors Humberstone and Rowley sent apologies.

Councillors Bely-Summers, Corais, Djafari-Marbini, Gotch, Goddard, Iley-Williamson, Turner arrived and Councillors Haines and McManners left during the meeting as shown in the minutes.

## **67. Declarations of interest**

Councillor Gant declared that he was a trustee of Ark T, the owner of the Venue Community Rooms referred to in the public address by Artwell, but this was not a pecuniary interest.

## **68. Minutes**

Council agreed to **approve** the minutes of both the special meeting and the ordinary meeting held on 26 November 2018 as true and correct records.

## **69. Appointment to Committees**

Councillor Gant announced and Council noted appointments to the Liberal Democrat seats on:

- Investigation and Disciplinary Committee - Councillor Wade
- Licensing and Gambling Acts Committee - Councillor Wade

Councillor Brown announced the appointment of Cllr Wade as the third Oxford City Council representative on The Katherine Rawson Trust with effect from 17 December 2018.

## **70. Announcements**

The Lord Mayor welcomed Councillor Liz Wade back to the Council following her election in the Wolvercote by-election on 6 December.

He welcomed the newly appointed City Rector and Vicar of St Michael at the North Gate, Rev Anthony Buckley.

The Lord Mayor announced:

- The annual Christmas Carol Concert had raised about £3000 for his charities.
- He had hosted a short service of reflection to commemorate Holocaust Memorial Day on 25 January
- The memorial service for Alderman Jean Fooks would be held on Saturday 2 February.
- The Lord Mayor's charity dinner would be on 9 March.

The Leader of the Council announced that the civic office holders for 2019/20, subject to confirmation at Annual Council, would be:

- Lord Mayor: Councillor Simmons
- Deputy Lord Mayor: Councillor Altaf-Khan
- Sheriff: Councillor Goddard

She announced a new Co-operatives champion, Councillor Howlett, to champion the expansion of the cooperative economy in the city.

She said she would be sending a letter to the Oxford University Union expressing disappointment on behalf of the Council at their decision to continue to invite speakers promoting controversial views, and ask the Union to consider its choices in light of the disruption to the city and costs to the police created by legitimate protests against these speakers.

## **71. Public addresses and questions that relate to matters for decision at this meeting**

There were no addresses or questions.

## **72. Council Tax Reduction Scheme 2019/20**

Councillors Bely-Summers, Corais, Djafari-Marbini, and Gotch arrived just prior to the start of this item.

Council considered a report of the Head of Financial Services submitted to the City Executive Board on 22 January 2019. The City Executive Board recommended the proposed changes to the Council Tax Reduction Scheme to Council.

Councillor Simm, Board Member for Supporting Local Communities, presented the report and moved the recommendations which were adopted on being seconded and put to the vote.

### **Council resolved to**

1. agree the changes to the Local Council Tax Reduction Scheme 2018/19 in the report to the City Executive Board and set out in the Appendix to the report; and
2. adopt as the new Local Council Tax Reduction Scheme for 2019/20 the current Local [Council Tax Reduction scheme](#) for 2018/19 with the inclusion of the changes listed in the report; and
3. delegate authority to the Head of Financial Services to finalise and publish the new Council Tax Reduction Scheme for 2019/20.

## **73. Report of the Independent Remuneration Panel and Draft Councillors' Allowances Scheme 2019-23**

Councillor Goddard arrived at the start of this item.

Council considered a report of the Head of Law and Governance setting out the recommendations of the Council's Independent Remuneration Panel (IRP) and a Draft Councillors' Allowances Scheme for 2019-23, to come into effect on 1 April 2019

Councillor Brown, Leader of the Council, presented the report and moved the recommendations.

Councillor Gant proposed an amendment to remove the allowance for the second deputy leader at 2(c)(iii) and make consequential changes to the scheme. On being seconded and put to the vote, the amendment was not agreed.

The recommendations in the report were agreed without change on being seconded and put to the vote.

**Council resolved to:**

1. Thank the Independent Remuneration Panel for their work.
2. Agree to include in the Councillors' Allowances Scheme 2019-23 the following provisions from the Councillors' Allowances Scheme 2015-19, as recommended by the Independent Remuneration Panel:
  - a) A basic allowance payable to all councillors of £5079 in 2019-20;
  - b) Indexation of the basic allowance in accordance with the annual percentage uplifts provided for in the local pay deal for council employees;
  - c) The following Special Responsibility Allowances (SRAs):
    - i. Leader - 3 x basic allowance (£15,237)
    - ii. Deputy Leader – 1 x basic allowance (£5,079)
    - iii. Non-statutory Deputy Leader - 1 x basic allowance (£5,079)
    - iv. Lord Mayor –1 x Basic Allowance (£5,079)
    - v. Deputy Lord Mayor – 0.25 x basic allowance (£1,270)
    - vi. Sheriff - 0.25 x Basic Allowance (£1,270)
    - vii. Board Members with particular responsibilities – 1.5 x basic allowance (£7,619)
    - viii. Board Members without particular responsibilities – 0.5 x basic allowance (£2,540)
    - ix. Chair of Scrutiny Committee – 1x basic allowance (£5,079)
    - x. Chair of Audit & Governance Committee – 0.25 x basic allowance (£1,270)
    - xi. Chair of Scrutiny Panel – 0.25 x basic allowance (£1,270) (Panel must meet at least 5 times to qualify. A maximum of 2 SRAs will be available (£2,508) to be shared by the Chairs of the qualifying Standing Panels)
    - xii. Opposition Group Leader – 1 x basic allowance (£5,079) to be shared between the group leaders equally;
  - d) The rule that councillors will receive a maximum of two special responsibility allowances (excluding civic office holders);
  - e) The rule that where a member of the Council is also a member of another council, that councillor may not receive allowances from more than one council in respect of the same duties;
  - f) The rule that a 15% reduction to a special responsibility allowance will be applied for councillors who attend less than two thirds of the scheduled meetings required within a special responsibility, with the additional clarifications explained in paragraphs 14-16.
  - g) No allowances to be paid to co-opted members;
  - h) The ability for councillors to elect to forgo any part of their entitlement to an allowance;
  - i) The rule that where allowances have been paid in advance for a period during which a councillor is no longer a councillor, those allowances should be repaid;

- j) Allowances for maternity or adoption leave, with the additional clarifications explained in paragraph 17;
  - k) Allowances for child and other dependants' care subject to a maximum of £1,000 per councillor per year (which can be increased by the Head of Law and Governance in special circumstances), with the additional clause explained in paragraph 18;
  - l) Allowances for travel to be paid for travel outside the City of Oxford boundary with the prior agreement of the Head of Law and Governance;
  - m) Reasonable adjustments for councillors with a temporary or permanent disability;
  - n) The rule that all claims for repayment must be made on the forms provided and should be accompanied by receipts/invoices as appropriate before payment can be authorised;
3. Agree that the special responsibility allowance for chairs of planning committees will be reduced to 0.5x basic allowance (previously 1.0x basic allowance).
  4. Agree to include in the scheme an application process for members who are in receipt of working age benefits (excluding Child Benefit) to claim for up to a maximum of £1,000 per year for travel expenses incurred within the City of Oxford boundary whilst on Council business as an exception to the normal rule (which is that allowances cannot be claimed for journeys within the City of Oxford boundary) and to allocate additional funding of £3,000 to the budget for travel allowances.
  5. Agree to allocate funding of £1,500 to allow for the £35 data protection fee payable to the Information Commissioner's Office for members to register as a "data controller" to be reimbursed to members, as recommended by the Independent Remuneration Panel (assuming this fee is retained for councillors following a government consultation).
  6. Agree that councillors will forgo part of their future allowance payments in the following circumstances:
    - a) A 15% reduction to the basic allowance will be applied for:
      - i. Members who fail to attend more than four meetings of Full Council in any municipal year except when a serious medical condition is the reason for absence;
      - ii. Members who fail to attend the induction training for newly elected councillors. A newly elected Councillor is any Councillor who was not holding City Council office before the election in question.
    - b) A 10% reduction to the basic allowance will be applied for:
      - i. Members who fail to attend compulsory planning and development control training (held every two years).
      - ii. Members who fail to attend compulsory code of conduct training (held annually).
      - iii. Members who are appointed to a Licensing Committee who fail to attend the compulsory licensing training (held annually).
  7. Adopt the Draft Councillors' Allowances Scheme 2019-23 the Councillors' Allowances Scheme 2019-23 attached as Appendix 2 to the report.

## **74. Pay Policy Statement 2019**

Council considered a report of the Head of Business Improvement asking Council to approve the Annual Pay Policy Statement.

Councillor Nigel Chapman, Board Member for Customer Focused Services, presented the report and moved the recommendations which were agreed on being seconded and put to the vote.

**Council resolved to approve the Annual Pay Policy Statement 2019/20 attached at Appendix 1 to the report.**

## **75. City Executive Board Minutes**

Council had before it the minutes of recent City Executive Board meetings.

### **a) Minutes of meeting Thursday 29 November 2018 of City Executive Board**

There were no questions on these minutes.

### **b) Minutes of meeting Tuesday 18 December 2018 of City Executive Board**

There were no questions on these minutes.

## **76. Questions on Notice from Members of Council**

49 written questions were asked of the Board members and Leader, and written responses published. These, written responses, and summaries of the 18 supplementary questions and responses are set out [in the printed pack of these minutes](#).

## **77. Annual Report on Oxfordshire Partnerships**

*This item was taken before the public addresses.*

Councillor Iley-Williamson arrived at the start of this item

Council had before it the report of Oxfordshire County Council summarising the work of the Oxfordshire-wide Partnerships.

Councillor Brown introduced the report.

### Health and Well Being Board (HWB) sub group Integrated System Delivery Board (ISDB)

Councillor Djafari-Marbini asked whether the ISDB's operation would lead to crucial decisions on health care delivery being made in private and without the involvement of elected representatives, and be detrimental to the principles of open decision making and democratic involvement.

Councillor Upton replied that there was no intention for the work of the HWB and its subgroups to be opaque. While some meetings would be in private where there was

good reason, all formal proceedings of the HWB are held in public and formal reports from the subgroups would be taken in public.

#### Growth Board and OxLEP

Councillor Simmons noted

Councillor Brown said she would raise these points as appropriate for consideration in the Growth Board and OxLEP's work and in the developing Oxfordshire 2050 plan. In reply to a question from Councillor Wolff she said that the Growth Board was not taking forward plans for a strategic infrastructure tariff at this time.

**Council noted the report.**

### **78. Scrutiny Committee update report**

*This item was taken before the public addresses.*

Council had before it the report of the Scrutiny Committee Chair.

The Chair, Councillor Gant, introduced the report and thanked the scrutiny officer for his work for the committee and its panels and also for his work supporting the initial meetings of the Growth Board's Scrutiny Panel.

He asked councillors to contribute items for consideration for the Scrutiny Committee work plan for 2019/20.

**Council noted the report.**

### **79. Public addresses and questions that do not relate to matters for decision at this Council meeting**

Councillor Turner arrived at the start of this item and Councillor McManners left at the end of this item.

There were five addresses to Council and one question to a Board Member.

1. Dr Sheikh Ramzy gave an address in support of the motion (at 81c) on adopting a definition of Islamophobia
2. Joanna Gill gave an address in support of the motion (at 81b) on taking immediate action to prevent further climate change.
3. Linnet Drury gave an address in support of the motion (at 81b) to declare a climate emergency.
4. Artwell gave an address asking for the refurbishment of the Barton Royal British Legion building to create a community venue.

5. Judith Harley gave an address asking Council to reconsider the newly agreed road name for the Temple Cowley Pools slip road.
6. Artwell asked a question about the consultancy costs for preparation of the city centre Movement and Public Realm strategy.

The full text of these speeches and questions where these were read as submitted; responses from the Board Members in writing before the meeting; and summaries of the verbal responses given at the meeting are set out [in the printed pack of these minutes](#).

## **80. Motions on notice 2018/19**

Council had before it six motions on notice and amendments submitted in accordance with Council procedure rules and reached decisions as set out below.

### **Council resolved to adopt the following motions as set out in these minutes:**

- a. Retaining democratic rights for EU27 citizens
- b. Declaring a climate emergency.
- c. Adopting a definition of Islamophobia.
- d. To oppose the Oxford-Cambridge expressway as it is currently proposed, to continue to press national government for more investment in sustainable transport, and to ask the Department for Transport to urgently clarify its proposals around the Expressway.

The following motions were not taken as the time allocated for debate had elapsed:

- e. Protecting the Oxford name
- f. Opposing mental health funding cuts by the County Council

### **a) Retaining democratic rights for EU27 citizens**

*This item was taken before the public addresses.*

Councillor Harris, seconded by Councillor Garden, proposed the submitted motion as set out in the agenda and briefing note.

After debate and on being put to the vote the motion was agreed.

### **Council resolved to adopt the following motion:**

This Council, while continuing to oppose Brexit which it believes to be a disaster for the United Kingdom,

**requests the leader of the Council** to write to the Prime Minister asking for a pledge that whatever the ultimate outcome of the Brexit process, EU 27 Citizens currently entitled to vote and to stand for election to local government will continue to be able to do so, that existing local authority members who are EU 27 citizens will remain members of those authorities, and that the Government will not use its statutory power pursuant to the EU (Withdrawal) Act 2018 to alter existing arrangements in these respects.



## **b) Declaring a Climate Emergency**

Councillor Simmons, seconded by Councillor Wolff, proposed the submitted motion as set out in the agenda and briefing note.

Councillor Simmons accepted the amendment from Councillor Hayes set out in the briefing note.

After debate and on being put to the vote the amended motion was agreed.

**Council resolved to adopt the following motion, as amended:**

### **Council notes that:**

a) the recent 2018 IPCC report states that we have just 12 years to act on climate change if global temperature rises are to be kept within the recommended 1.5 degrees Celsius;

b) all governments (national, regional and local) have a duty to limit the negative impacts of climate breakdown, and local governments that recognise this should not wait for their national governments to change their policies. UK cities

need to commit to aggressive reduction targets and carbon neutrality as quickly as possible;

c) cities are well placed to lead the world in reducing carbon emissions, as their higher density opens up a range of sustainable transport, buildings and energy opportunities;

d) the 5% carbon reduction target – as defined by our Carbon Management Plan - is by our implemented measures (including control and influence of council), not the actual emissions reductions. The target has consistently been met on this basis;

e) the Council's absolute carbon emissions have reduced by just over 10% (10.17%) over the last five years – an average of 2% per year (Source: Oxford City Council 'Greenhouse Gas Emissions from Local Authority own estate and operations: Reporting year 2017-18' (August 2018));

f) although the Council's carbon emissions reduced in 2017/18 due to changes in the national grid, the Council's underlying energy and fossil fuel consumption actually went UP slightly - a 2.1% increase in electricity, a 0.8% increase in gas and a 5.4% increase in carbon from vehicle fuel. (Source: Oxford City Council 'Greenhouse Gas Emissions from Local Authority own estate and operations: Reporting year 2017- 18' (August 2018)).

The increasing commercial activities of the Council provides upward pressure on the carbon emissions, but in the main services are being offered locally and at a lower carbon intensity than other commercial concerns providing the service from outside the area would be operating at.

f) This Council is only responsible for 1% of the city's CO<sub>2</sub> emissions and works in partnership to achieve ambitious city-wide targets to reduce emissions by 40% by 2020. Although the City Council is managing to deliver absolute carbon reductions – despite the upward pressures on carbon emissions caused by changes in the structure of its operations and services and variability caused by factors such as the weather - it

is not delivering the necessary absolute carbon reductions fast enough to meet either the UK's 2050 80% reduction target or the 1.5 degree Celsius target.

**In light of the above, the Council therefore agrees to:**

1. Join other Councils in declaring a Climate Emergency;
2. Continue to call on Westminster to provide the necessary powers and resources to make local action on climate change easier;
3. Encourage this Council to establish a Citizens Assembly made up of a representative range of Oxford citizens to establish the facts and make recommendations for our city.
4. Continue to work with partners across the city and region to deliver widespread carbon reductions.
5. Note that this Council is a forward-looking council at tackling climate change with a very strong record. The Council has installed enough solar PV across its estate to generate the equivalent of 10% of our annual electricity from onsite generation, reducing CO<sub>2</sub> emissions by 380tonnes/year and reduces bills by over £100,000/year). We currently purchase accredited green electricity for practically all sites and have a policy to buy green if the price is not more than 2% above the price of standard electricity. This Council uses a **£1m revolving loan fund** to reduced energy costs by over £400k/year.
6. Note that this Council works heavily in partnership, including coordinating the [Low Carbon Oxford](#) network – a local collaborative of over 40 organisations that are responsible for the majority of Oxford's CO<sub>2</sub> emissions and which have committed to reduce their emissions by 3% each year. The Council is participating in [OxFutures II Growing Oxfordshire's Low Carbon Economy](#), a multi-stakeholder partnership to grow Oxfordshire's low carbon economy through assisting SMEs to reduce energy consumption and implement energy efficiency projects.

**c) Adopting a definition of Islamophobia**

Councillor Haines left during this item.

Councillor Arshad, seconded by Councillor Azad, proposed the submitted motion as set out in the agenda and briefing note.

After debate and on being put to the vote the motion was agreed.

**Council resolved to adopt the following motion:**

Oxford City Council is proud of its diversity and has a huge asset and a source of great strength. A substantial proportion of its residents are Muslim, who are an integral part of its make-up, playing a huge role in all aspects of the Oxford City's life. Oxford City has a strong history of promoting cohesion and welcoming people from all over the world. Its residents have always united and supported each other in the fight against racism and discrimination in all its forms.

This Council therefore welcomes, endorses and adopts the working APPG (All-Party Parliamentary Group) definition of Islamophobia<sup>1</sup>, including all of its examples in full cited as follows:

"ISLAMOPHOBIA IS ROOTED IN RACISM AND IS A TYPE OF RACISM THAT TARGETS EXPRESSIONS OF MUSLIMNESS OR PERCEIVED MUSLIMNESS."

Contemporary examples of Islamophobia in public life, the media, schools, the workplace, and in encounters between religions and non-religions in the public sphere could, considering the overall context, include, but are not limited to:

- Calling for, aiding, instigating or justifying the killing or harming of Muslims in the name of a racist/fascist ideology, or an extremist view of religion.
- Making mendacious, dehumanizing, demonizing, or stereotypical allegations about Muslims as such, or of Muslims as a collective group, such as, especially but not exclusively, conspiracies about Muslim entryism in politics, government or other societal institutions; the myth of Muslim identity having a unique propensity for terrorism and claims of a demographic 'threat' posed by Muslims or of a 'Muslim takeover'.
- Accusing Muslims as a group of being responsible for real or imagined wrongdoing committed by a single Muslim person or group of Muslim individuals, or even for acts committed by non-Muslims.
- Accusing Muslims as a group, or Muslim majority states, of inventing or exaggerating Islamophobia, ethnic cleansing or genocide perpetrated against Muslims.
- Accusing Muslim citizens of being more loyal to the 'Ummah' (transnational Muslim community) or to their countries of origin, or to the alleged priorities of Muslims worldwide, than to the interests of their own nations.
- Denying Muslim populations, the right to self-determination e.g., by claiming that the existence of an independent Palestine or Kashmir is a terrorist endeavour.
- Applying double standards by requiring of Muslims behaviours that are not expected or demanded of any other groups in society, eg loyalty tests.
- Using the symbols and images associated with classic Islamophobia.
- Holding Muslims collectively responsible for the actions of any Muslim majority state, whether secular or constitutionally Islamic.

**This Council asks the Executive Board Member for a Safer and Greener Environment to:**

1. Write to government ministers asking them to listen to Muslim communities and the cross-party group of MPs and peers and to adopt this definition of Islamophobia which classifies discrimination against Muslims as a form of racism.
2. Continue to prioritise tackling hate crime and Islamophobia in partnership. Oxford City Council works with partners, especially Thames Valley Police, on a rolling basis, and will now coordinate future actions in line with this definition of Islamophobia for all Muslims.

---

<sup>1</sup> The report and full definition can be found [here](#)

- d) To oppose the Oxford-Cambridge expressway as it is currently proposed, to continue to press national government for more investment in sustainable transport, and to ask the Department for Transport to urgently clarify its proposals around the Expressway.**

Councillor Gant, seconded by Councillor Landell Mills, proposed the submitted motion as set out in the agenda and briefing note.

Councillor Gant accepted the amendments from both Councillor Hollingsworth and Councillor Simmons as set out in the briefing note.

After debate and on being put to the vote the amended motion was agreed.

**Council resolved to adopt the following motion, as amended:**

Council notes that the Leader of the Council noted the Government's announcement of the proposed corridor for the Oxford to Cambridge Expressway and then went on to say: "However, this opaque process - with the decision made by Highways England – does little to reduce uncertainty for people in Oxford and those that travel to work here. It remains wholly unclear which side of Oxford the final route will take, let alone how the Expressway might help reduce the congestion on the overstretched A34 and A40. "The interface between the proposed Expressway and the new East-West Rail is also key. We welcome the commitment to plan for and invest in major infrastructure to support housing and economic growth in Oxfordshire, but we want to see the development of integrated transport systems and the prioritisation of clean, green and public transport. These principles need to be central in determining the final detailed route. We will now look closely at the proposals and will want to make sure there is a meaningful public consultation conducted by Highways England."

In addition, council notes that through her position on the Growth Board, the Leader has ensured that the Growth Board has not endorsed proposals for an Expressway but has expressed concerns over the lack of clarity and emphasised that should such a proposal go ahead, the main priority needs to be integration with public transport.

Council regrets the lack of clarity from government on its proposals which contributes to considerable uncertainty both about how the Expressway is intended to deliver benefit, and about the possible impact on homes, lives, the environment, amenities and facilities, including in and adjacent to the greater Oxford area.

In particular, Council notes with regret that:

1. It is unclear what the word "Expressway" means in this context
2. Insufficient work has been done on the potential of enhanced rail links to deliver better outcomes for passengers, freight, and sustainable economic growth
3. Actual and proposed consultation is inadequate
4. It is unclear which of a range of possible justifications for the Expressway, which potentially contradict each other, are being used, including:
  - a) A 'strategic route' to carry freight traffic from the west and south to the east.
  - b) A route to make commuting between Oxford/Milton Keynes/Bedford/Cambridge easier and quicker.

c) A road that will enable significant housing growth of 1,000,000 extra houses along its length.

d) Relieving traffic on the A34, as one member of the Growth Board has stated publicly (which does not appear to be one of the stated aims, and current plans do not rule out using the A34 in part as the Expressway, which would of course add more traffic to it)

5. Increased road building will inevitably have a serious negative impact on air quality and make the achievement of climate change targets much more challenging at a time when all public bodies must seek to use every part of their planning, investment and delivery mechanisms to achieve air quality improvements and significant carbon reductions; and

Increased road building will inevitably have a serious negative impact on air quality at a time when all public bodies must seek to use every part of their planning, investment and delivery mechanisms to achieve the opposite and that the challenges we all face because of climate change require us to make important choices about our future.

**Council therefore resolves to oppose the Expressway as it is currently proposed, to continue to press national government for more investment in sustainable transport, and to ask the Department for Transport to urgently clarify its proposals around the Expressway.**

**e) Protecting the Oxford Name**

This motion was not taken as the time allowed for debate had finished.

**f) Opposing mental health funding cuts by the County Council**

This motion was not taken as the time allowed for debate had finished.

**The meeting started at 5.00 pm and ended at 8.25 pm**

**Chair .....**

**Date: Wednesday 13 February 2019**

This page is intentionally left blank