

# MINUTES OF THE EAST AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

Wednesday 7 September 2016

www.oxford.gov.uk



**COUNCILLORS PRESENT:** Councillors Henwood (Vice-Chair, in the Chair), Chapman, Clarkson, Hollingsworth, Lloyd-Shogbesan, Smith, Paule, Wilkinson and Wolff.

**OFFICERS PRESENT:** Robert Fowler (Principal Planner), Michael Morgan (Lawyer), Andrew Murdoch (Planning Team Leader), Nadia Robinson (Planning), Sarah Stevens (Planning Service Transformation Consultant) and Jennifer Thompson (Committee and Members Services Officer)

## 28. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE AND SUBSTITUTIONS

Councillors Coulter and Taylor sent apologies and Councillors Hollingsworth and Smith respectively substituted for them.

## 29. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Councillor Wilkinson stated for the record that she had been extensively involved in the discussions around this application but she came to the committee with an open mind.

## 30. 16/01565/FUL: INSTALLATION OF UNDERGROUND HEATING PIPES AND ASSOCIATED WORKS (ENERGY LINK) BETWEEN THE JOHN RADCLIFFE AND CHURCHILL HOSPITALS, HEADINGTON

The Committee considered an application for planning permission for the installation of underground heating pipes, electrical cabling, communication cabling and associated works to allow the transfer of energy and high capacity/high speed data between the John Radcliffe and Churchill Hospitals, together with the creation of temporary car parking and construction compounds for the duration of construction activities (part retrospective) on land running from Churchill Hospital to John Radcliffe Hospital, Headley Way.

The Planning Officer reported that Thames water and the gas and electricity suppliers had made no comments.

Roz Smith, County Councillor, spoke about the application.

Paul Gredley, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application, Mark Worcester and Simon Jones accompanied him to answer questions. He

explained details of the scheme including arrangements for access to properties. He said that the company were keen to make a suitable contribution to the community and were open to community-led suggestions that provided benefit to the whole of the affected area. He said that VitalEnergi had carried out and documented a highway conditions survey (dilapidations survey) of the whole route including Lime Walk and would re-survey and document the route again before work started.

The Committee asked questions of officers and the speakers.

Options for the wording of condition 14 - Construction Traffic Management Plan were proposed by officers and debated. The Committee agreed that this should be neither unduly prescriptive nor unduly open and that it should be capable of amendment with appropriate consultation but without delaying the project. They noted that a suitable plan had been submitted as part of the application documents but that the Highways Authority wished this to be capable of amendment as the works proceeded.

The Committee agreed to add or amend the following conditions:

C9: Temporary car park: provide suitable lighting – to ensure safety when using these after dark

C14: Construction management plan: Condition to state *The development hereby permitted shall be carried out only in accordance with the Construction Traffic Management Plan dated 1 July 2016 or such other construction traffic management plan as the local planning authority has agreed in writing.*

Before agreeing changes, the local planning authority should consult the Committee Chair and the ward members in both affected wards. This allowed the plan to be amended speedily as required taking into account local needs and other works.

And also include in C14: *Roadsweeping to be carried out as required by the Highways Authority* – to ensure that road surfaces remain at the required standard.

Add C19: *Applicant to negotiate or provide access to an electric vehicle charging point for residents who lose access to this during the works.*

Add C20: *Communication plan and sample leaflets to be submitted to the local planning authority, to give details of leaflets (including phone numbers) to be distributed to all properties and updates to the Hospital Trust's project page, and any other communications planned.* This is to ensure that residents, visitors, and ward councillors can be kept informed of the work schedule, road closures, and mitigation.

The Committee agreed to add two informatives, accepting that these had no impact on the permission, for the avoidance of doubt and clarity as to the extent of the permission:

- a) Oxford City Council bears no responsibility for matters relating to the ownership of land.
- b) It should be noted that additional maintenance work may require additional planning permission if it constitutes and engineering operation.

**The Committee resolved to** approve planning permission for application 16/01565/FUL subject to the following conditions set out in the officer's report and as agreed at the meeting:

1. Development begun within time limit.
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans.
3. Materials.
4. Tree Protection Plan (TPP) 2.
5. Arboricultural Method Statement (AMS) 2.
6. Monitoring and Supervision of Trees.
7. De-compaction of RPAs.
8. Noise mitigation measures.
9. Temporary Car Park including providing suitable lighting.
10. JR Compound.
11. Churchill Compound.
12. Welfare Compound.
13. Visitor Permits.
14. Construction Traffic Management Plan - The development hereby permitted shall be carried out only in accordance with the Construction Traffic Management Plan dated 1 July 2016 or such other construction traffic management plan as the local planning authority has agreed in writing (noting consultation with Chair and ward members).  
Roadsweeping to be carried out as required by the Highways Authority – to ensure that road surfaces remain at the required standard.
15. Hours of Work.
16. Arch - Implementation of programme.
17. Use of Pipework.
18. Air Quality Measures.
19. Applicant to negotiate or provide access to an electric vehicle charging point for residents who lose access to this during the works.
20. Communication plan and sample leaflets to be submitted to the local planning authority, to give details of leaflets (including phone numbers) to be distributed to all properties and updates to the Hospital Trust's project page, and any other communications planned.

Informatives:

- a) Oxford City Council bears no responsibility for matters relating to the ownership of land.
- b) It should be noted that additional maintenance work may require additional planning permission if it constitutes and engineering operation.

**31. 16/01549/CT3: PHASE 2 - NORTHWAY AND MARSTON FLOOD ALLEVIATION SCHEME- RECREATION GROUND, COURT PLACE FARM, MARSH LANE.**

The Committee considered an application for planning permission for Phase 2 of the Northway and Marston Flood Alleviation Scheme comprising the creation of a flood storage area adjacent to Court Place Farm Nature Park (Site B), channel realignment along a section of Peasmoor Brook and installation of a bund at Peasmoor Piece (Site C) (Amended plans and additional information) at Recreation Ground, Court Place Farm, Marsh Lane.

The Planning Officer reported that subsequent to publication of the report a formal response was received from Natural England who raised no objection and did not request any conditions.

Helen Vaughan-Evans and Jo Colwell, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

**The Committee resolved to grant planning permission for application 16/01549/CT3 subject to the following conditions:**

1. Development begun within time limit.
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans.
3. Tree Protection Plan (TPP) 1.
4. Arboricultural Method Statement (AMS) 1.
5. Excavation close to tree RPAs.
6. Landscape carry out by completion.
7. Great Crested Newts.
8. Bats and reptiles.
9. Ecological Management Monitoring Plan.
10. General mitigation measures biodiversity.
11. Removal of vegetation.
12. Planting and management plan.
13. Materials management plan.
14. Watching brief - land quality.
15. Archaeology.
16. Construction Travel Management Plan.

**32. 16/00744/FUL: 39 - 41 WAYNFLETE ROAD, LAND TO THE REAR AND OFF BAYSWATER FARM ROAD**

The Committee considered an application for planning permission for the demolition of existing pair of semi-detached houses (39 and 41 Waynflete Road); erection of 52 houses and flats (including 40% of net increase as affordable homes) in single storey buildings, two storey buildings, and two storey buildings with rooms in roofs (47 dwellings proposed off Waynflete Road and 5 detached dwellings off Bayswater Farm Road); construction of roads and footpaths including new accesses off Waynflete Road and Bayswater Farm Road;

provision of open space, parking, garages and landscaping at 39 And 41 Waynflete Road, Land to the Rear and off Bayswater Farm Road.

The Committee considered the section of the application site located within the administrative boundaries of Oxford City Council and noted South Oxfordshire District Council Planning Committee approved the part of the application within their boundaries on 10 August 2016.

Nik Lyzba, the agent, and Andrew Blacker, transport consultant, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

**The Committee resolved** to grant planning permission for application 16/00744/FUL subject to the following conditions:

1. Development begun within time limit.
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans.
3. Phasing Plan for development.
4. Landscape plan required.
5. Landscape carry out by completion.
6. Details of the means of access to the site.
7. Details of visibility splays.
8. Drainage Strategy on/off site works to be agreed in conjunction with Thames Water.
9. Surface water drainage scheme.

### **33. 16/01402/FUL: ST LUKES HOSPITAL, LATIMER ROAD, OX3 7PF**

The Committee considered an application for planning permission for the removal of the existing pitched roof, a new reception area with 2 additional bedrooms over, an off-site constructed second storey to house 20 new bedrooms and associated external works at St Luke's Hospital, Latimer Road.

The Planning Officer recommended adding a condition requiring a travel information pack be compiled and given to staff (as set out in para 29 of the report).

Máire Davis, local resident, spoke about her concerns with the application, including air pollution, landscaping and reducing the risk of damage to the boundary fence between the site and The Brambles.

Richard Burden, CEO of St Lukes Hospital, spoke in support of the application, Graham Candy, Matthew Baalam and Dan Boucher, accompanied him to answer questions.

The Committee agreed to add further conditions:

- (15) requiring a travel information pack be compiled and given to staff ;
- (16) details of fenestration to ensure there is no potential for rooms overheating from sunlight on southerly facing windows to protect the amenity and health of residents;

and to amend condition (5) to include details of treatment of the boundary with The Brambles to reduce the impact of the development and take the opportunity to reduce the potential for damage to the boundary fence.

**The Committee resolved** to approve application 16/01402/FUL subject to the following conditions:

1. Development begun within time limit.
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans.
3. Samples.
4. Tree Protection Plan (TPP) 2.
5. Landscape plan (to include details of treatment of the boundary with The Brambles)
6. Landscape management plan.
7. Details of photovoltaics.
8. Drainage strategy
9. Land quality risk assessment.
10. Land quality report.
11. Parking plan.
12. Cycle parking.
13. Shower and lockers – cyclists.
14. Construction Travel Plan.
15. Travel information pack be compiled and given to staff
16. Details of fenestration to ensure there is no potential for rooms overheating from sunlight on southerly facing windows.

**34. 16/01373/FUL: HOLY TRINITY CHURCH, TRINITY ROAD, HEADINGTON**

The Committee considered an application for planning permission for the erection of a single storey extension to north elevation at Holy Trinity Church, Trinity Road.

The Planning Officer reported a correction to the report at paragraph 20 4<sup>th</sup> sentence to read ‘...the works will lead to **no** impact on bats’.

Stephanie Meesom accompanied by Jenifer Carpenter, representatives from Holy Trinity Preservation group, spoke against the application. Among other points she raised concerns about the lack of access to and destruction of graves arising from the extension and from construction works and the lack of details in the proposed scheme.

Canon David Knight, on behalf of the applicant, and Christian Randall, the architect, spoke on support of the application.

The Committee asked questions of speakers and the planning officer. They noted that details of the disposal of sewage were covered by condition 6. While members sympathised with the concerns about disturbance to graves, they noted that these were not material planning considerations but matters for

ecclesiastical law, and could not be taken into account in this decision. The Committee also noted the need for careful control of vehicle movements on the highway given the location but agreed with officers' advice not to impose a condition requiring a construction travel management plan.

**The Committee resolved** to grant planning permission for application 16/01373/FUL subject to the following conditions:

1. Development begun within time limit.
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans.
3. Samples on site.
4. Tree Protection Plan (TPP) 1.
5. Arboricultural Method Statement (AMS) 1.
6. Drainage.
7. Contamination Risk Assessment.
8. Contamination Remedial Works.
9. Bats.
10. Bats – lighting.
11. Window details.

### **35. 16/01737/FUL: QUARRY GATE, 19 WHARTON ROAD**

The Committee considered an application for planning permission for the erection of three storey building to provide 1 x 1-bed, 3 x 2-bed and 2 x 3-bed flats (Use Class C3) and provision of car parking and bin and cycle storage at The Quarry Gate, 19 Wharton Road, Oxford.

Brian Warn, local resident, and Roz Smith, County Councillor, spoke objecting to the application.

Neil Perry, the agent for the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

The Committee noted the Council's policies on the provision of affordable homes.

**The Committee resolved** to refuse planning permission for the following reasons:

1. The proposed building would have a radically different visual appearance, which coupled with its substantial height and prominent siting would introduce a discordant and incongruous addition to the streetscene. The use of a flat roof and unsympathetic built form would mean that the building would appear as a series of monolithic blocks which would be completely at odds with the harmonious character of the surrounding area where the built environment is characterised by suburban 1930s semi-detached and terraced dwellinghouses with pitched roofs. The fenestration of the proposed building and other architectural detailing which includes two balconies framed by a rectangular element contribute to the alien appearance of the proposed building. The development

cannot therefore be considered to be high quality design that responds to its context and is contrary to Policy CP1, CP8 and CP10 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016, Policy CS18 of the Core Strategy (2011) and Policy HP9 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013).

2. The application seeks the development of more than three dwellings; as a result a financial contribution is required towards the provision of affordable housing as set out in Policy HP4 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013). The applicant has indicated that they are not willing to provide a financial contribution. The development also fails to provide any on-site provision of affordable housing and no evidence has been provided to indicate that on-site provision or a financial contribution towards affordable housing would make the scheme unviable. As a result, the development is contrary to Policy HP4 of the Sites and Housing Plan (2013) and Policy CS24 of the Core Strategy (2011).

**36. 16/00701/CT3: BARTON ADVENTURE PLAYGROUND, FETTIPLACE ROAD, OX3 9LY**

The Committee considered an application for planning permission for the erection of 4No floodlights for the use of the Taggs Gate Multi Use Games Arena (MUGA) at Barton Adventure Playground, Fettiplace Road.

**The Committee resolved** to grant planning permission for application 16/00701/CT3 subject to the following conditions:

1. Development begun within time limit.
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans.
3. Materials.
4. Floodlighting.
5. Hours of operation.

**37. 16/01830/CT3 : LAND ADJACENT TO 9 ASHHURST WAY**

The Committee considered an application for planning permission for the formation of 5no. residents' parking spaces on land adjacent to 9 Ashhurst Way.

**The Committee resolved** to grant planning permission for application 16/01830/CT3 subject to the following conditions:

1. Development begun within time limit.
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans.
3. Materials.
4. Tree protection.
5. Landscape plan required.
6. Landscape carry out after completion.
7. Ground resurfacing to be SUDS compliant.
8. Access works to Highway Authority standards.



### **38. MINUTES**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 3 August 2016 as a true and accurate record.

### **39. FORTHCOMING APPLICATIONS**

The Committee noted the list of forthcoming applications.

### **40. DATES OF FUTURE MEETINGS**

The Committee noted the dates of future meetings.

**The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 9.10 pm**